

RFP #21104 - Automated Rakes for Fine Screening of Wastewater
Closed January 18, 2022 at 5:00 p.m.

			* JCI Industries, Inc. *			MegaKC			Ray Lindsey Company			Ross Construction		
Proposal Scores		Maximum Weight	A	B	C	A	B	C	A	B	C	A	B	C
1	Did proposer respond to all requirements of the RFP?	Yes/No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
2	Evidence of experience & references with similar projects	20	18	19	19	18	18	18	18	17	18	18	19	19
3	Expertise of personnel	20	18	18	18	18	18	18	15	18	18	18	18	18
4	Applicable resources	20	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	17	18	18	17	17
5	Responses to requirements section and project narrative	25	20	22	21	18	18	19	20	20	19	20	21	18
6	Price	15	15	15	15	13	13	13	11	11	11	11	11	11
	Total	100	89	92	91	85	85	86	82	83	84	85	86	83
	Average Score		91			85			83			85		
	Cost Proposal		\$ 314,466.00			\$ 361,450.00			\$ 415,042.00			\$ 434,800.00		

* JCI Industries, Inc. proposal recommended for award as best value proposal.

Comments from Evaluators

Proposer 1 - JCI Industries, Inc.

I like the design to get grit up to the dumpster because it has less moving parts and should require less maintenance than other solutions. Also, the added alarms for SCADA and ability to use the old bar screen if equipment fails will be nice.

JCI sells and installs the proposed screen and provides references at several locations.

Personnel involved are listed and experience, background, responsibilities, and certifications are listed for each individual.

JCI lists the capability to perform electrical motor repair, provide field service, pump repair, and other industry related services. Services performed originate from the local proximity of the company.

Drawings of wet well and proposed screen are included. Provisions were made to maintain an elevated non-submersible components.

Evidence of experience and references with similar projects: JCI provided multiple references with services similar to what was requested in the RFP. JCI has their own install crew as well as providing the bar screen.

Expertise of personnel: Resumes and background info given for each team member.

Applicable resources: JCI is located in Lee's Summit for maintenance or service calls. In the proposal, it mentions training for city personnel, but doesn't specify exactly how much training is to be provided.

Responses to requirements section and project narrative: JCI sells and installs the Kusters brand of bar screen. JCI has all motors up and out of the wet well area to eliminate the possibility of a high wet well potentially damaging any motors. JCI is proposing a platform be constructed for access to top of bar screen for preventative maintenance to washer system and drive motor.

Proposer 2 - MegaKC

<p>Very detailed proposal. The solution does have a few more moving parts than other solutions. 5 year warranty. I have some concerns about a washer/compactor mounted below grade due to potential water intrusion into electrical components. The added alarms for SCADA would be an asset for us.</p>
<p>Mega, Letts Van Kirk/Mid-America Pump, and Duperon list examples of current and previously completed projects in their proposal for other bar screens that they have installed. Mega is familiar with the Sugar Creek Pump Station from projects completed there in the past.</p>
<p>Mega, Letts Van Kirk/Mid-America Pump, and Duperon list specific personnel, their years of experience, past projects, titles, job duties, Education, and certifications. Also included is Mega's previous 5 years worth of OSHA injury reporting.</p>
<p>Mega lists their available equipment resources in the proposal. Screen maintenance, cost of maintenance, screen downtime, and a maintenance interval schedule has been provided by Duperon. A two hour training session will be provided upon completion of project. Letts Van Kirk is located in Kansas City, MO and is a rep. for Duperon placing their location locally to the site.</p>
<p>The proposer did not take exception to the City's terms. Duperon provided drawings depicting the screen's placement and design. The placement of the washer/compactor within the wet well leaves it susceptible to water damage in the event of a high wet well level. Mega lists a project completion date of mid September 2022. Mega, and Duperon clearly define their role in the project, as installer and screen designer. Mega has performed work at this location in the past, making them familiar with the location.</p>

Evidence of experience and references with similar projects: MegaKC gave examples of three similar projects that included bar screening and grit removal. Duperon provided many examples of the FlexRake style of screening being installed on projects similar in scope and size. Mid-America Pump have several installations in and around the Kansas City Metro area.
Expertise of personnel: MegaKC provided background and experience of specific personnel along with OSHA’s Form 300A summary of work related injury report. Mid- America Pump provided experience and background of specific personnel.
Applicable Resources: Mega has provided a list of projects that included bar screen installs, a proposed timeline for this project with a start around mid-August and completion around the middle of September of this year. Duperon would provide training of 2 hours. Mid-America Pump is located in Kansas City for maintenance and service calls.
Responses to requirements section and project narrative: Duperon provided drawings showing a washer compactor down by the wet well leaving it susceptible to water damage in the case of a high wet well at the station.

Proposer 3 - Ray Lindsey Company

The screening lengthened to the top grade elevation provides less moving parts and will cause less maintenance issues. This design meets our needs, but costs more than others.
Ray Lindsey lists similar projects with the Vulcan screens that they are proposing.
The contractor assigned to the City’s project has experience in this line of work and is the sole employee of the company.
Vulcan is somewhat local, they say about 3.5 hours away in Iowa. They will also provide the necessary training upon completion of the project.
The proposer did take exception to the City’s standard terms and conditions and included their own. Proposer did take into consideration the flooding

Evidence of experience and references with similar projects: Davis Structure and Development gave multiple references of similar scope and size. Vulcan is the brand of screen we have at Sugar Creek pump station currently, and has been operational for many years. Ray Lindsey can fabricate parts for the current screen in operation.
Expertise of personnel: All companies included with this proposal have experienced personnel that show they are familiar with a project of this scope and size.
Applicable resources: Ray Lindsey Company is located in Belton, MO for maintenance and service calls. The proposed team gave several different options of bar screen styles. Standard quality assurance includes Ray Lindsey being able to fabricate any part to any one of the Vulcan screens.
Responses to requirements section and project narrative: Did the proposer take exception to the City's standard terms and conditions or proposed contract? Yes, included their own Ray Lindsey, Davis Structure, and Vulcan have given us several different options of bar screen placement, as well as a couple options of the style of bar screen. All options that were included with the proposal, help our problem of removing the rags from the lower level of the pump station and the inclusion of finer screening. A unique approach the team took, was to raise the bar screen high enough out of the wet well area to allow for a discharge chute to dispose of the rags right into a dumpster without a washer compactor.

Proposer 4 - Ross Construction

Very detailed proposal. The solution does have a few more moving parts than
Ross Construction and Parkson include experiences and references from projects previously performed.
Ross Construction and Parkson include personnel experience and background in the proposal.
Proposer will offer training upon completion of project. Local Haynes office in Kansas. Personnel from Ross and Haynes introduced and provided experiences and background.

The proposer takes into account the desire to keep vital components elevated. Ross and Haynes' roles on the project are clearly defined.
Evidence of experience and references with similar projects: Parkson Technical Proposal includes installs and references. Parkson included many examples of similar installs. Serpentix have completed over 500 pathwinder installations.
Expertise of personnel: Parkson included list of personnel with background info. Serpentix included list of personnel and background info
Applicable resources: Haynes service tech available locally (Shawnee, KS) Parkson start-up services include training for city personnel. Response time for local technician (next day) if absolutely necessary.
Responses to requirements section and project narrative: David E. Ross and Haynes took into account the possibility of a high wet well at the pump station by keeping motors and vital equipment up high eliminating the risk of water damage. A unique approach was the addition of Serpentix pathwinder conveyor, which would take the rags that fall off the screen to a dumpster.