

RFP #22013 Primary Clarifier Rehabilitation
 Closed March 10, 2022 at 5:00 p.m.

Proposal Scores			Barr Engineering Company				* Garver, LLC *			
			A	B	C	D	A	B	C	D
1	Evidence of experience & references with similar projects	30	22	24	25	25	27	25	26	30
2	Expertise of personnel	25	23	21	20	23	23	22	21	25
3	Applicable resources	20	15	16	15	20	15	15	17	20
4	Responses to requirements section and project narrative	25	20	20	20	20	21	22	22	25
	Total	100	80	81	80	88	86	84	86	100
	Average Score		82				89			

* Garver, LLC recommended as best technical proposal offeror.

Comments from Evaluators

Proposer 1 - Barr Engineering Company

Four clients of similar scope were submitted. Plenty of evidence to support their experience. Resources were sited and resumes were given. Training seemed adequate.
Evidence of experience of proposer & references with similar projects section: Barr gave multiple examples of projects of similar scope and size. Barr has worked specifically with the Rock Creek team on several different items.
Expertise of personnel section: Barr and Bartlett and West who Barr is teaming with, gave a very thorough and extensive look into the experience and background of individuals that would be assigned to the city's project
Applicable resources section: Barr has 10 offices in the U.S. and Canada. Bartlett and West is located in the Midwest and will staff this project from its Lee's Summit, Missouri and Overland Park, Kansas offices. Training will consist of: A project-specific operation and maintenance manual provided by the equipment supplier. Dedicated time while at the site for training of operators, and multiple trips to the site by factory trained technicians.
Responses to requirements section and project narrative section: Barr gave a detailed review and rundown of how the project would be completed. One thing I think they could have added, is exactly how they would address the plastics and grease being handled at the primaries. Barr gave the city a very well-drawn proposal, along with the experience and background from Barr and Bartlett and West that would certainly benefit the longevity of the primary clarifiers.

Barr has submitted a quality proposal. Barr highlighted all of their team members with their background, years of service, education, and experience. They also submitted multiple projects of similar size and scope that the team has overseen in the past.

Proposer 2 - Garver, LLC

Plenty of evidence to support their experience. Resources were sited and resumes were given. Training was listed. I appreciated that plastic and sludge handling was addressed, and a solution was provided.

Evidence of experience of proposer & references with similar projects section: Over the past ten years Garver has provided design services for clarifier improvements all over the U.S. Multiple examples were given in detail throughout the Midwest similar to Rock Creek's primary rehab project.

Expertise of personnel section: Garver provided background info and resumes for each team member that would be assigned to the city's project. The background info showed Garver having a multitude of experience in new build and rehab of clarifier systems.

Applicable resources section: Making the city's project a priority and having the resources to do so. A construction observer from Garver is in Kansas City and has a team of 10 resident project representatives ready to support with the project. Training consists of sessions arranged for plant staff and making sure we have all the needed information and training for proper operation and maintenance of the equipment.

Responses to requirements section and project narrative section:
Garver has outlined in their proposal challenges that we are dealing with at the plant and given us possible solutions to discuss. A unique approach Garver took was the addition of a possible way to get the plastics and grease that are collected in the primary scum pits to a dumpster.

Garver has submitted a good proposal including everything that was requested. They show examples of similar projects. Garver has listed their team and all of their qualifications, achievements, education, background, and years of experience.